

Highlights

- Our study tests Carlsmith and Darley's (2008) dual-process model of punitive reactions. Along the way, we sought to replicate Keller et al. (2010, Exp. 2).
- We made minor wording changes to some of Keller et al.'s items, added several items, removed three filler items, and used scenarios about five types of crime (instead of one). Moreover, our study was run in English (instead of German) and used a sample from the UK (instead of from Germany, Switzerland and Austria).
- All other aspects of the original study were held constant.
- We conceptually replicate Keller et al. (2010, Exp. 2), obtaining larger (though comparable) effect sizes. We conclude that our results support the robustness of their findings, which corroborates the intuitive retributivism hypothesis. In contrast, we did not find any evidence for the dual-process model of punitive reactions.